HEALTH WEALTH CAREER

#### NORTH CAROLINA SUPPLEMENTAL RETIREMENT PLANS

#### GOAL MAKER GLIDEPATH DISCUSSION

**SEPTEMBER 21, 2017** 

Liana Magner, CFA Kelly Henson Will Dillard, CFA

MAKE TOMORROW, TODAY MERCER

# **STARTING POINT**



# CURRENT GOAL MAKER ALLOCATIONS

|           | Portfolios               | <b>C01</b><br>0-5yrs | <b>CO2</b><br>6-10yrs | <b>CO3</b><br>11-15yrs | <b>CO4</b><br>16+yrs | <b>M01</b><br>0-5yrs | <b>M02</b><br>6-10yrs | <b>M03</b><br>11-15yrs | <b>M04</b><br>16+yrs | <b>R01</b><br>0-5yrs | <b>R02</b><br>6-10yrs | <b>R03</b><br>11-15yrs | <b>R04</b><br>16+yrs |
|-----------|--------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------------|------------------------|----------------------|
|           | NC Stable Value          | 40%                  | 35%                   | 22%                    | 10%                  | 31%                  | 21%                   | 14%                    | 5%                   | 17%                  | 13%                   | 7%                     | 0%                   |
|           | NC Fixed Income Index    | 17%                  | 14%                   | 13%                    | 10%                  | 13%                  | 13%                   | 10%                    | 5%                   | 12%                  | 10%                   | 6%                     | 0%                   |
| ns        | NC Fixed Income          | 16%                  | 14%                   | <b>12</b> %            | 10%                  | 13%                  | 12%                   | 10%                    | 4%                   | 12%                  | 10%                   | 5%                     | 0%                   |
| Optio     | NC Inflation Responsive  | 8%                   | 8%                    | <mark>8</mark> %       | 8%                   | <b>9%</b>            | <mark>9</mark> %      | 9%                     | 9%                   | 10%                  | 10%                   | 10%                    | 10%                  |
|           | NC Large-Cap Value       | 1%                   | 2%                    | 3%                     | 3%                   | 2%                   | 3%                    | 4%                     | 5%                   | 3%                   | 4%                    | 5%                     | 6%                   |
| nvestment | NC Large-Cap Index       | 4%                   | 4%                    | <b>7</b> %             | 8%                   | 5%                   | 7%                    | 7%                     | 10%                  | 7%                   | 7%                    | 8%                     | 11%                  |
| đ         | NC Large-Cap Growth      | 1%                   | 2%                    | 3%                     | 3%                   | 2%                   | 3%                    | 4%                     | 5%                   | 3%                   | 4%                    | 5%                     | 6%                   |
| ves       | 📒 NC Small Mid-Cap Value | 2%                   | 3%                    | 5%                     | 7%                   | 4%                   | 5%                    | 7%                     | 10%                  | 6%                   | 7%                    | 9%                     | 11%                  |
| Ē         | NC Small Mid-Cap Growth  | 2%                   | 3%                    | 5%                     | 7%                   | 4%                   | 5%                    | 7%                     | 10%                  | 6%                   | 7%                    | 9%                     | 11%                  |
|           | NC Global Equity Fund    | 6%                   | 10%                   | 15%                    | 23%                  | 11%                  | 15%                   | 19%                    | 25%                  | 16%                  | 19%                   | 24%                    | 30%                  |
|           | NC International         | 3%                   | 5%                    | 7%                     | 11%                  | 6%                   | 7%                    | 9%                     | 12%                  | 8%                   | <mark>9</mark> %      | 12%                    | 15%                  |

# INCREASING NUMBER OF PORTFOLIOS

### PRUDENTIAL'S PROPOSED GOAL MAKER 3X9 MODEL

| Aggressive           |     |       | Post-Retirement |       |      |     |     |      |     |
|----------------------|-----|-------|-----------------|-------|------|-----|-----|------|-----|
| Years to Retirement  | 26+ | 21-25 | 16-20           | 11-15 | 6-10 | 0-5 | 0-5 | 6-10 | 11+ |
| US Large             | 31% | 32%   | 31%             | 29%   | 28%  | 25% | 22% | 22%  | 20% |
| SMID Growth          | 12% | 12%   | 11%             | 10%   | 9%   | 8%  | 7%  | 6%   | 5%  |
| SMID Value           | 12% | 12%   | 11%             | 10%   | 9%   | 8%  | 7%  | 6%   | 5%  |
| International Stocks | 25% | 24%   | 23%             | 22%   | 19%  | 15% | 13% | 12%  | 11% |
| Emerging             | 10% | 10%   | 9%              | 8%    | 6%   | 5%  | 4%  | 3%   | 2%  |
| Bonds                | 2%  | 2%    | 5%              | 8%    | 12%  | 17% | 20% | 21%  | 23% |
| SV                   | 1%  | 1%    | 3%              | 6%    | 11%  | 16% | 22% | 25%  | 29% |
| Real Assets          | 7%  | 7%    | 7%              | 7%    | 6%   | 6%  | 5%  | 5%   | 5%  |

| Moderate Pre-Retirement |     |       |       |       |      |     | Post-Retirement |      |     |
|-------------------------|-----|-------|-------|-------|------|-----|-----------------|------|-----|
| Years to Retirement     | 26+ | 21-25 | 16-20 | 11-15 | 6-10 | 0-5 | 0-5             | 6-10 | 11+ |
| US Large                | 33% | 31%   | 28%   | 24%   | 22%  | 17% | 16%             | 16%  | 14% |
| SMID Growth             | 11% | 10%   | 9%    | 8%    | 7%   | 6%  | 5%              | 4%   | 3%  |
| SMID Value              | 11% | 10%   | 9%    | 8%    | 7%   | 6%  | 5%              | 4%   | 3%  |
| International Stocks    | 22% | 21%   | 19%   | 17%   | 13%  | 11% | 10%             | 7%   | 7%  |
| Emerging                | 9%  | 8%    | 7%    | 6%    | 5%   | 4%  | 3%              | 3%   | 2%  |
| Bonds                   | 4%  | 7%    | 11%   | 15%   | 19%  | 23% | 25%             | 26%  | 27% |
| SV                      | 3%  | 7%    | 11%   | 17%   | 22%  | 28% | 32%             | 36%  | 40% |
| Real Assets             | 7%  | 6%    | 6%    | 5%    | 5%   | 5%  | 4%              | 4%   | 4%  |

| Conservative         |     | Pre-Retirement |       |       |      |     |     |      | Post-Retirement |  |  |
|----------------------|-----|----------------|-------|-------|------|-----|-----|------|-----------------|--|--|
| Years to Retirement  | 26+ | 21-25          | 16-20 | 11-15 | 6-10 | 0-5 | 0-5 | 6-10 | 11+             |  |  |
| US Large             | 28% | 24%            | 21%   | 17%   | 14%  | 13% | 11% | 11%  | 10%             |  |  |
| SMID Growth          | 9%  | 8%             | 7%    | 6%    | 5%   | 4%  | 3%  | 2%   | 2%              |  |  |
| SMID Value           | 9%  | 8%             | 7%    | 6%    | 5%   | 4%  | 3%  | 2%   | 2%              |  |  |
| International Stocks | 19% | 17%            | 14%   | 11%   | 9%   | 6%  | 5%  | 4%   | 4%              |  |  |
| Emerging             | 8%  | 7%             | 5%    | 4%    | 3%   | 2%  | 2%  | 1%   | 0%              |  |  |
| Bonds                | 11% | 15%            | 17%   | 20%   | 23%  | 26% | 27% | 28%  | 28%             |  |  |
| SV                   | 11% | 17%            | 25%   | 32%   | 37%  | 42% | 46% | 49%  | 51%             |  |  |
| Real Assets          | 5%  | 4%             | 4%    | 4%    | 4%   | 3%  | 3%  | 3%   | 3%              |  |  |

#### PRUDENTIAL'S PROPOSED GOAL MAKER GLIDEPATH VS. PEER GROUP UNIVERSE



Growth Asset Allocation<sup>1</sup>

Source: Mercer Quarterly Target Date Fund Survey (Q1 2017 including 70 TDFs) <sup>1</sup> Assumes 55% of PIMCO IRMAF Fund is growth oriented (strategic targets)

### PRUDENTIAL'S PROPOSED GOAL MAKER GLIDEPATH VS. PEER GROUP UNIVERSE

International Equities as a % of Total Equity



• The domestic/international equity split slightly varies depending on the risk tolerance and age band but is generally in line with the peer group median

Source: Mercer Quarterly Target Date Fund Survey (Q1 2017 including 70 TDFs)

### PRUDENTIAL'S PROPOSED GOAL MAKER GLIDEPATH VS. PEER GROUP UNIVERSE

**Inflation Sensitive Asset Allocation** 



• The proposed real asset allocation is in line with the peer group universe in the longer dated funds but is largely underweight as participants near retirement

Source: Mercer Quarterly Target Date Fund Survey (Q1 2017 including 70 TDFs)

# ACTIVE/PASSIVE MIX

# GOAL MAKER ACTIVE/PASSIVE MIX

| Asset Class          | Current              | Proposed     | Comments   |
|----------------------|----------------------|--------------|--|
| US Large Cap Equity  | 50/50 Active/Passive | 100% Passive | <ul> <li>Lower alpha potential due to<br/>market efficiency (higher analyst<br/>coverage and institutional<br/>ownership)</li> <li>Lower success rate of median<br/>manager net of fees</li> </ul>   |
| US SMID Cap Equity   | 100% Active          | 100% Active  | <ul><li>Strong alpha opportunities exist</li><li>Implemented in 2012</li></ul>   |
| International Equity | 100% Active          | 100% Active  | <ul><li>Good alpha opportunities</li><li>Implemented in 2012</li></ul>   |
| Core Fixed Income    | 50/50 Active/Passive | 100% Active  | <ul> <li>Good alpha opportunities</li> <li>Strong results for median active manager relative to the Index</li> <li>Credit markets offer active management potential for skilled investors able to anticipate downgrades, defaults or manage rating misclassifications</li> </ul> |

# GOAL MAKER ACTIVE/PASSIVE MIX

#### Core Fixed Income Universe

Quarterly Excess Return vs. Bloomberg Barclays US Aggregate with rolling 3 yr line in \$US (before fees) over 15 yrs ending June-17 Comparison with the US Fixed Core Investment Grade universe



```
Created on 3 Aug 2017 at 5:04 PM
```

MERCER

• Median manager has historically outperformed the Bloomberg Barclays U.S. Aggregate Index (gross of fees) based on rolling three-year performance

# GOAL MAKER ACTIVE/PASSIVE MIX

#### Large Cap Universe

Quarterly Excess Return vs. Russell 1000 with rolling 3 yr line in \$US (before fees) over 15 yrs ending June-17 Comparison with the US Equity Large Cap Equity universe



```
Created on 3 Aug 2017 at 5:02 PM
```

MERCER

 Median manager outperformed the Russell 1000 Index (gross of fees) prior to 2011 based on rolling three-year periods but performance has been challenged more recently

# **GLOBAL EQUITY FUND**

### NORTH CAROLINA GLOBAL EQUITY FUND



- Currently, the Goal Maker Program utilizes the Global Equity Fund throughout the glidepath
- In order to better manage the US/Non US equity split, we recommend eliminating the Global Equity Fund from the Goal Maker program and allocating those assets between US and non-US allocations
- Roughly 94% of the assets within the Global Equity Fund are from the Goal Maker glidepath allocation (Approximately \$60M of the \$910M in Fund assets were self directed)
- If GM assets were removed from Global Equity Fund, the Fund's investment management expenses would increase 10 basis points to 0.675%
- Consider eliminating the Global Equity Fund from the NC core line up

# INFLATION HEDGING ASSETS



# PIMCO IRMAF FUND(3/31/17)



- NC offers the PIMCO IRMAF Fund which has varying allocations to ILBs, commodities and REITs
- The Fund has strategic targets to underlying asset classes but this can change based on market opportunities
- In order to better manage the inflation risks for participants nearing or in retirement, we recommend the addition of a dedicated TIPs portfolio

# GLIDEPATH RECOMMENDATIONS

#### MERCER RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO PROPOSED 3X9

| Aggressive           |       | Pre-Retirement |       |       |        |        |        | Post-Retirement |        |  |  |
|----------------------|-------|----------------|-------|-------|--------|--------|--------|-----------------|--------|--|--|
| Years to Retirement  | 26+   | 21-25          | 16-20 | 11-15 | 6-10   | 0-5    | 0-5    | 6-10            | 11+    |  |  |
| US Large             | 3.0%  | 2.0%           | 1.0%  | 1.0%  | 0.0%   | 2.0%   | 3.0%   | 2.0%            | 1.0%   |  |  |
| SMID Growth          | -5.0% | -5.0%          | -4.0% | -4.0% | -4.0%  | -3.0%  | -3.0%  | -3.0%           | -2.0%  |  |  |
| SMID Value           | -5.0% | -5.0%          | -4.0% | -4.0% | -4.0%  | -3.0%  | -3.0%  | -3.0%           | -2.0%  |  |  |
| International Stocks | -1.0% | 0.0%           | 0.0%  | -1.0% | 1.0%   | 4.0%   | 4.0%   | 2.0%            | 3.0%   |  |  |
| Emerging             | 6.0%  | 6.0%           | 6.0%  | 7.0%  | 6.0%   | 0.0%   | 0.0%   | 3.0%            | 1.0%   |  |  |
| Bonds                | 0.0%  | 0.0%           | 2.0%  | 5.0%  | 9.0%   | 10.0%  | 6.0%   | -2.0%           | -4.0%  |  |  |
| SV                   | -1.0% | -1.0%          | -3.0% | -6.0% | -10.0% | -13.0% | -14.0% | -11.0%          | -12.0% |  |  |
| Real Assets          | 3.0%  | 3.0%           | 2.0%  | 2.0%  | 1.0%   | 0.0%   | -1.0%  | -2.0%           | -2.0%  |  |  |
| TIPs                 | 0.0%  | 0.0%           | 0.0%  | 0.0%  | 1.0%   | 3.0%   | 8.0%   | 14.0%           | 17.0%  |  |  |

5%-9% increase/decrease in allocation

| Moderate             |       |       | Pre-Ret | irement |        | -      | Post-Retirement |        |        |  |
|----------------------|-------|-------|---------|---------|--------|--------|-----------------|--------|--------|--|
| Years to Retirement  | 26+   | 21-25 | 16-20   | 11-15   | 6-10   | 0-5    | 0-5             | 6-10   | 11+    |  |
| US Large             | 0.0%  | -1.0% | -1.0%   | 0.0%    | -1.0%  | 2.0%   | 2.0%            | 0.0%   | 0.0%   |  |
| SMID Growth          | -4.0% | -4.0% | -3.0%   | -3.0%   | -3.0%  | -3.0%  | -2.0%           | -2.0%  | -1.0%  |  |
| SMID Value           | -4.0% | -4.0% | -3.0%   | -3.0%   | -3.0%  | -3.0%  | -2.0%           | -2.0%  | -1.0%  |  |
| International Stocks | 1.0%  | 0.0%  | 0.0%    | 0.0%    | 1.0%   | 0.0%   | 2.0%            | 2.0%   | 1.0%   |  |
| Emerging             | 6.0%  | 7.0%  | 6.0%    | 5.0%    | 5.0%   | 4.0%   | 0.0%            | 2.0%   | 2.0%   |  |
| Bonds                | 2.0%  | 6.0%  | 10.0%   | 13.0%   | 14.0%  | 13.0%  | 9.0%            | 1.0%   | -4.0%  |  |
| SV                   | -3.0% | -7.0% | -11.0%  | -14.0%  | -16.0% | -18.0% | -18.0%          | -17.0% | -18.0% |  |
| Real Assets          | 2.0%  | 3.0%  | 2.0%    | 2.0%    | 1.0%   | 0.0%   | 0.0%            | 0.0%   | -1.0%  |  |
| TIPs                 | 0.0%  | 0.0%  | 0.0%    | 0.0%    | 2.0%   | 5.0%   | 9.0%            | 16.0%  | 22.0%  |  |

10%-19% increase/decrease in allocation

20%-25% increase/decrease in allocation

| Conservative          |        |        | Pre-Ret | Post-Retirement |        |        |        |        |        |
|-----------------------|--------|--------|---------|-----------------|--------|--------|--------|--------|--------|
| Years to Retirement   | 26+    | 21-25  | 16-20   | 11-15           | 6-10   | 0-5    | 0-5    | 6-10   | 11+    |
| US Large              | -1.0%  | 0.0%   | -1.0%   | 0.0%            | 0.0%   | 0.0%   | 0.0%   | -1.0%  | -1.0%  |
| SMID Growth           | -3.0%  | -3.0%  | -3.0%   | -2.0%           | -2.0%  | -2.0%  | -1.0%  | -1.0%  | -1.0%  |
| SMID Value            | -3.0%  | -3.0%  | -3.0%   | -2.0%           | -2.0%  | -2.0%  | -1.0%  | -1.0%  | -1.0%  |
| International Stocks  | 0.0%   | 0.0%   | 0.0%    | 1.0%            | 2.0%   | 1.0%   | 3.0%   | 2.0%   | 2.0%   |
| Emerging              | 5.0%   | 4.0%   | 6.0%    | 2.0%            | 2.0%   | 3.0%   | -1.0%  | 2.0%   | 2.0%   |
| Bonds                 | 10.0%  | 16.0%  | 20.0%   | 21.0%           | 19.0%  | 15.0%  | 9.0%   | 5.0%   | 1.0%   |
| SV                    | -11.0% | -17.0% | -21.0%  | -24.0%          | -25.0% | -25.0% | -24.0% | -24.0% | -25.0% |
| Real Assets RCER 2017 | 3.0%   | 3.0%   | 2.0%    | 1.0%            | 0.0%   | 0.0%   | 0.0%   | -1.0%  | -1.0%  |
| TIPs                  | 0.0%   | 0.0%   | 0.0%    | 3.0%            | 6.0%   | 10.0%  | 15.0%  | 19.0%  | 24.0%  |

#### MERCER RECOMMENDED GLIDEPATH

| Aggressive            |     | -     | Post-Retirement |       |      |     |     |      |     |
|-----------------------|-----|-------|-----------------|-------|------|-----|-----|------|-----|
| Years to Retirement   | 26+ | 21-25 | 16-20           | 11-15 | 6-10 | 0-5 | 0-5 | 6-10 | 11+ |
| US Large              | 34% | 34%   | 32%             | 30%   | 28%  | 27% | 25% | 24%  | 21% |
| SMID Cap Equity       | 14% | 14%   | 14%             | 12%   | 10%  | 10% | 8%  | 6%   | 6%  |
| International Stocks  | 24% | 24%   | 23%             | 21%   | 20%  | 19% | 17% | 14%  | 14% |
| Emerging <sup>1</sup> | 16% | 16%   | 15%             | 15%   | 12%  | 5%  | 4%  | 6%   | 3%  |
| Bonds                 | 2%  | 2%    | 7%              | 13%   | 21%  | 27% | 26% | 19%  | 19% |
| SV                    | 0%  | 0%    | 0%              | 0%    | 1%   | 3%  | 8%  | 14%  | 17% |
| Real Assets           | 10% | 10%   | 9%              | 9%    | 7%   | 6%  | 4%  | 3%   | 3%  |
| TIPs                  | 0%  | 0%    | 0%              | 0%    | 1%   | 3%  | 8%  | 14%  | 17% |

| Moderate              |     |       | Pre-Ret | irement | Post-Retirement |     |     |      |     |
|-----------------------|-----|-------|---------|---------|-----------------|-----|-----|------|-----|
| Years to Retirement   | 26+ | 21-25 | 16-20   | 11-15   | 6-10            | 0-5 | 0-5 | 6-10 | 11+ |
| US Large              | 33% | 30%   | 27%     | 24%     | 21%             | 19% | 18% | 16%  | 14% |
| SMID Cap Equity       | 14% | 12%   | 12%     | 10%     | 8%              | 6%  | 6%  | 4%   | 4%  |
| International Stocks  | 23% | 21%   | 19%     | 17%     | 14%             | 11% | 12% | 9%   | 8%  |
| Emerging <sup>1</sup> | 15% | 15%   | 13%     | 11%     | 10%             | 8%  | 3%  | 5%   | 4%  |
| Bonds                 | 6%  | 13%   | 21%     | 28%     | 33%             | 36% | 34% | 27%  | 23% |
| SV                    | 0%  | 0%    | 0%      | 3%      | 6%              | 10% | 14% | 19%  | 22% |
| Real Assets           | 9%  | 9%    | 8%      | 7%      | 6%              | 5%  | 4%  | 4%   | 3%  |
| TIPs                  | 0%  | 0%    | 0%      | 0%      | 2%              | 5%  | 9%  | 16%  | 22% |

| Conservative          | onservative Pre-Retirement |       |       |       |      |     | Post-Retirement |      |     |  |
|-----------------------|----------------------------|-------|-------|-------|------|-----|-----------------|------|-----|--|
| Years to Retirement   | 26+                        | 21-25 | 16-20 | 11-15 | 6-10 | 0-5 | 0-5             | 6-10 | 11+ |  |
| US Large              | 27%                        | 24%   | 20%   | 17%   | 14%  | 13% | 11%             | 10%  | 9%  |  |
| SMID Cap Equity       | 12%                        | 10%   | 8%    | 8%    | 6%   | 4%  | 4%              | 2%   | 2%  |  |
| International Stocks  | 19%                        | 17%   | 14%   | 12%   | 11%  | 7%  | 8%              | 6%   | 6%  |  |
| Emerging <sup>1</sup> | 13%                        | 11%   | 11%   | 6%    | 5%   | 5%  | 1%              | 3%   | 2%  |  |
| Bonds                 | 21%                        | 31%   | 37%   | 41%   | 42%  | 41% | 36%             | 33%  | 29% |  |
| SV                    | 0%                         | 0%    | 4%    | 8%    | 12%  | 17% | 22%             | 25%  | 26% |  |
| Real Assets           | 8%                         | 7%    | 6%    | 5%    | 4%   | 3%  | 3%              | 2%   | 2%  |  |
| TIPs                  | 0%                         | 0%    | 0%    | 3%    | 6%   | 10% | 15%             | 19%  | 24% |  |

<sup>1</sup> North Carolina does not offer stand alone Emerging Market Equity Fund, the EM exposure will be gained through the International Equity Fund

#### MERCER RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO PROPOSED 3X9 MODEL

- Maintained the growth/fixed income split provided by Prudential throughout the glidepath
- Within domestic equity, the total SMID allocation is capped at 30% in the longer dated funds and scales down to 20% as participants near retirement
  - Prudential's proposed model included a significant overweight to SMID throughout the glidepath
- Mercer recommends maintaining an allocation to real assets along with adding an allocation to short-term TIPS as participants near retirement
- The PIMCO IRMAF allocation is utilized in the longer dated/mid stage of the glidepath and is capped at 10% of the overall growth allocation
- TIPs are introduced as participants near retirement for inflation protection and ramp up to 1/3 of the fixed income allocation in the income portfolio
- TIPs allocation is mainly funded through a reduction in the stable value allocation

## SCENARIO RETURNS - 5 YR HORIZON





| -1.5%    | Balanced<br>Growth | Inflationary<br>Growth | Stagflation | Weak<br>Growth | Ideal<br>Growth |
|----------|--------------------|------------------------|-------------|----------------|-----------------|
| Current  | 1.2%               | 0.5%                   | -1.2%       | 0.5%           | 2.0%            |
| Add TIPS | 1.5%               | 0.6%                   | -0.9%       | 0.6%           | 2.1%            |

• Adding TIPs projects favorably in a variety of different economic scenarios

### MERCER RECOMMENDATION VS. PEER GROUP UNIVERSE



- The domestic/international equity split is consistent across the three risk tolerances
- The domestic equity allocation is in line with the MSCI ACWI in the longer dated funds but a domestic bias develops as a participant nears retirement

Source: Mercer Quarterly Target Date Fund Survey (Q1 2017 including 70 TDFs)

### MERCER RECOMMENDATION VS. PEER GROUP UNIVERSE



• Mercer recommends a higher allocation to TIPs as participants near retirement in order to better deal with inflation

Source: Mercer Quarterly Target Date Fund Survey (Q1 2017 including 70 TDFs)

# DOMESTIC EQUITY MARKET CAPITALIZATION BREAKDOWN



- The Prudential 3X9 model is largely overweight SMID cap equity relative to the Russell 3000
- Mercer recommends overweighting SMID cap equity relative to large caps but keeps the overweight within 10% of the domestic equity benchmark

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Average split large/smid split across the glidepath

# **FEE EVALUATION**



#### FEE EVALUATION<sup>1</sup>

|                                    |       |       | Post-Retirement |       |       |       |       |       |       |
|------------------------------------|-------|-------|-----------------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|-------|
| Years to Retirement                | 26+   | 21-25 | 16-20           | 11-15 | 6-10  | 0-5   | 0-5   | 6-10  | 11+   |
| Current Aggressive                 | 0.50% | 0.50% | 0.50%           | 0.46% | 0.41% | 0.39% | 0.39% | 0.39% | 0.39% |
| Current Moderate                   | 0.46% | 0.46% | 0.46%           | 0.41% | 0.38% | 0.37% | 0.37% | 0.37% | 0.37% |
| Current Conservative               | 0.41% | 0.41% | 0.41%           | 0.37% | 0.35% | 0.32% | 0.32% | 0.32% | 0.32% |
| Mercer Recommendation Aggressive   | 0.36% | 0.36% | 0.35%           | 0.34% | 0.32% | 0.29% | 0.26% | 0.25% | 0.25% |
| Mercer Recommendation Moderate     | 0.35% | 0.34% | 0.33%           | 0.32% | 0.30% | 0.27% | 0.26% | 0.25% | 0.24% |
| Mercer Recommendation Conservative | 0.33% | 0.31% | 0.30%           | 0.28% | 0.27% | 0.25% | 0.24% | 0.23% | 0.22% |

<sup>1</sup> Based on 6/30/17 Fund investment management expenses

# **APPENDIX**



© MERCER 2017

# ECONOMIC/ASSUMPTION SETTING

### **Mean-Variance Assumptions**

- Assumptions reflect April 2017 conditions
- Returns shown are based on 20-year horizon; fixed income returns are significantly below long-term equilibrium due to current low yield environment and expectation of rising rates

|    |  | Geometric | Standard  | Correlation Matrix |        |        |        |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
|----|--|-----------|-----------|--------------------|--------|--------|--------|------|------|------|------|------|------|------|
|    | Asset Class                                | Return    | Deviation | 1                  | 2      | 3      | 4      | 5    | 6    | 7    | 8    | 9    | 10   | 11   |
| 1  | US Large Cap Equity                        | 6.3%      | 18.1%     | 1.00               |        |        |        |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| 2  | US Small/Mid Cap Equity (Smid)             | 6.5%      | 20.5%     | 0.95               | 1.00   |        |        |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| 3  | Non-US Developed Large Cap Equity Unhedged | 7.6%      | 20.3%     | 0.77               | 0.73   | 1.00   |        |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| 4  | Emerging Markets Equity Unhedged           | 9.1%      | 26.4%     | 0.73               | 0.70   | 0.76   | 1.00   |      |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| 5  | US Aggregate FI                            | 3.6%      | 5.3%      | 0.11               | 0.10   | 0.03   | (0.03) | 1.00 |      |      |      |      |      |      |
| 6  | Stable Value/GICs                          | 3.6%      | 3.5%      | (0.04)             | (0.04) | (0.07) | (0.10) | 0.50 | 1.00 |      |      |      |      |      |
| 7  | US Inflation Indexed FI                    | 3.2%      | 5.6%      | 0.11               | 0.11   | 0.03   | (0.01) | 0.67 | 0.36 | 1.00 |      |      |      |      |
| 8  | EM Govt FI - Hard Currency                 | 5.3%      | 11.6%     | 0.54               | 0.51   | 0.43   | 0.55   | 0.55 | 0.23 | 0.39 | 1.00 |      |      |      |
| 9  | US Real Estate - REITS                     | 6.5%      | 21.3%     | 0.68               | 0.71   | 0.54   | 0.51   | 0.32 | 0.11 | 0.25 | 0.50 | 1.00 |      |      |
| 10 | Commodities - Long Only                    | 3.2%      | 17.2%     | 0.31               | 0.30   | 0.42   | 0.40   | 0.20 | 0.06 | 0.33 | 0.28 | 0.27 | 1.00 |      |
| 11 | Gold                                       | 3.2%      | 17.1%     | 0.18               | 0.17   | 0.32   | 0.26   | 0.22 | 0.09 | 0.35 | 0.21 | 0.18 | 0.67 | 1.00 |

Inflation

2.2%

| 5-year Horizon         | Balanced<br>Growth | Inflationary<br>Growth | Stagflation | Weak Growth | Ideal Growth |
|------------------------|--------------------|------------------------|-------------|-------------|--------------|
| Inflation              | 2.4%               | 4.7%                   | 5.5%        | 1.4%        | 2.1%         |
| Economic Growth        | 2.1%               | 3.3%                   | 0.4%        | -0.2%       | 3.2%         |
| Domestic Equities      | 5.6%               | 10.0%                  | -0.3%       | 0.9%        | 10.2%        |
| International Equities | 8.1%               | 10.2%                  | -0.6%       | 6.3%        | 8.5%         |

# MARKET POTENTIAL LARGE AND SMALL CAPITALIZATION EQUITY

|                    | BREADTH  | INSIGHT  | DIVERSIFICATION   |
|--------------------|--|--|---|
| L A R G E<br>C A P | <ul> <li>High levels of liquidity and trading volume</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>High levels of broker coverage in<br/>large cap markets, particularly the<br/>US, though other developed<br/>markets are gaining coverage</li> <li>Market communication infrastructure<br/>and regulatory structure have<br/>fostered broad and rapid<br/>communication of virtually all<br/>market-impacting information</li> </ul>  | <ul> <li>Cross sectional volatility analysis<br/>suggests:         <ul> <li>Large caps have significantly<br/>lower levels of cross sectional<br/>volatility than the small cap<br/>market</li> </ul> </li> </ul>   |
| S M A L L<br>C A P | <ul> <li>Relatively illiquid market,<br/>particularly at smallest market<br/>capitalizations. General provision<br/>of market liquidity has been<br/>reduced following global stresses<br/>in financial services industry</li> <li>Extremely deep market provides<br/>greater number of stock names<br/>and increases likelihood of<br/>identifying undervalued<br/>opportunities</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Fewer market participants and<br/>lower institutional ownership<br/>means greater number of naïve<br/>investors in the space, aiding alpha<br/>generation potential</li> <li>Number of market-makers and<br/>available capital likely to have<br/>reduced following financial crisis</li> <li>More stock specific characteristics<br/>and informational asymmetries than<br/>large cap markets</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Large and small cap equity<br/>markets are reasonably<br/>uncorrelated</li> <li>Lower levels of correlation in<br/>European and<br/>Pacific Basin markets relative to<br/>the US suggest additional<br/>diversification opportunities</li> </ul> |
| SUMMARY            | institutional ownership.   | ore information-efficient than small cap<br>efficient and has the least raw market p<br>rge and small cap markets.   |   |

# MARKET POTENTIAL FIXED INCOME MARKETS

|           | BREADTH  | INSIGHT  | DIVERSIFICATION   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|-----------|--|--|---|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| SOVEREIGN | <ul> <li>High levels of depth and liquidity</li> <li>Average daily trading volume remains strong</li> <li>Government bonds account for the majority of global bond markets, although the amount of bonds outstanding has been impacted by quantitative easing initiatives over recent years</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>Pricing, executing and settling a trade is very efficient and inexpensive</li> <li>In Europe just 5% of investors in bonds are individual investors, in the US this is around 10%.</li> <li>High institutional ownership indicate limited alpha potential</li> <li>However, increasing level of non-profit maximising participants, including investors seeking to hedge liability risk without price as the dominant variable</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>Debt dynamics have grown<br/>increasingly worrisome in some<br/>advanced economies, and are<br/>expected to continue. This<br/>provides potentially rich pickings<br/>for active managers to add value</li> </ul>  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| CREDIT    | <ul> <li>Reasonable levels of liquidity,<br/>but turnover has reduced in<br/>recent years</li> <li>Investment grade market was<br/>approximately US\$ 5 trillion in<br/>2014, with trading volume of<br/>US\$ 3 trillion Non-Government<br/>bonds account for c.30% of world<br/>bond markets</li> </ul>   | Current volatile conditions and a<br>heightened risk of default provide<br>arguments in favour of active<br>management   | <ul> <li>Provide investors with the opportunity to choose from a wide variety of sectors, structures and credit-quality characteristics</li> <li>Global credit universe offers greater diversification by sector and issuer than regional markets ;though care needed in constructing mandates</li> </ul> |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| SUMMARY   | <ul> <li>Government bond markets are highly efficient and liquid markets, offering limited opportunity for active management over long time horizons. However, current market conditions may provide opportunities in the short to medium term.</li> <li>Credit markets offer active management potential for the skilled investor able to anticipate downgrades, defaults, upgrades or manage rating misclassifications.</li> </ul> |  |   |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

# ACTUAL DELIVERY OF OUTPERFORMANCE EQUITY MARKETS

- The following tables show the historical excess returns of the median manager across equity markets over the 1,3,5 and 10 years to 31 December 2015, on both a gross and net of fees basis.
- 'Chain linked' annual medians have been used to reduce survivorship bias issues.
- To highlight evidence of 'alpha' we have ranked the 10 year excess historical performance of each asset class on the following basis:

| ALPHA RANKING<br>(%PA) |                            |  |  |  |  |  |
|------------------------|----------------------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| HIGH                   | Greater than 2.00%         |  |  |  |  |  |
| GOOD                   | 1.00% to 2.00%             |  |  |  |  |  |
| MEDIUM                 | 0.50% to 1.00%             |  |  |  |  |  |
| SOME                   | <b>SOME</b> 0.00% to 0.50% |  |  |  |  |  |
| LOW Less than 0.00%    |                            |  |  |  |  |  |

- The results on a gross and net of fee basis indicate:
  - The median developed global equity manager has modestly outperformed the index on a gross of fees basis in the long term. Fees have eroded the alpha gained over the 10 year period to December 2015
  - US large cap equity managers have provided some evidence of outperformance, gross of fees, over time. However, there is no evidence of outperformance net of fees, across any periods analysed
  - Strong evidence of outperformance by the median small cap manager over the 10 year period
  - The median emerging market manager has provided evidence of outperformance over the 10 years gross of fees. However, high fees have eroded most the alpha gained, with net results behind over the 10 year period

# EQUITY MARKETS: ACTIVE MANAGER RELATIVE PERFORMANCE, GROSS OF FEES

| A S S E T<br>C L A S S           |              | IAN VEF<br>OSS OF | T Y P I C A L<br>F E E | АГЬНА       |                     |                            |
|----------------------------------|--------------|-------------------|------------------------|-------------|---------------------|----------------------------|
|                                  | 1<br>Y E A R | 3<br>Y E A R S    | 5<br>Y E A R S         | 10<br>YEARS | HURDLE <sup>3</sup> | R A N K I N G <sup>2</sup> |
| Global Equity                    | 0.40         | -0.17             | -0.50                  | 0.38        | 0.66                | S O M E                    |
| Global ex-US Equity              | 0.60         | 0.32              | 0.46                   | 0.94        | 0.65                | MEDIUM                     |
| US Large Cap Equity              | 0.30         | 0.19              | 0.04                   | 0.08        | 0.50                | S O M E                    |
| Global ex-US Small<br>Cap Equity | 4.40         | 3.18              | 2.95                   | 1.69        | 0.89                | GOOD                       |
| US Small Cap Equity              | 2.30         | 1.82              | 2.00                   | 1.03        | 0.79                | GOOD                       |
| Emerging Markets<br>Equity       | 1.00         | 1.36              | 1.02                   | 0.74        | 0.88                | MEDIUM                     |

<sup>1</sup> 'Chain linked' median manager annual return versus index in \$US to 31 December 2015. Indices used are provided in the Appendix

<sup>2</sup> Evidence of skill grading ("alpha ranking") based on rolling 10 year median of universe and index returns

<sup>3</sup> Based on Mercer's Global Asset Management Fee Survey 2014 for a \$100m mandate. \$US Segregated vehicles have been used where available

# FIXED INCOME MARKETS: ACTIVE MANAGER RELATIVE PERFORMANCE, GROSS OF FEES

| A S S E T<br>C L A S S    |              | IAN VEF<br>DSS OF | TYPICA<br>L    | ALPHA       |                            |                            |
|---------------------------|--------------|-------------------|----------------|-------------|----------------------------|----------------------------|
|                           | 1<br>Y E A R | 3<br>Y E A R S    | 5<br>Y E A R S | 10<br>YEARS | FEE<br>HURDLE <sup>2</sup> | R A N K I N G <sup>3</sup> |
| Global Fixed              | 0.20         | 0.38              | 0.68           | 0.64        | 0.35                       | GOOD                       |
| US Fixed                  | 0.20         | 0.38              | 0.48           | 0.63        | 0.28                       | GOOD                       |
| US Government             | 0.40         | -0.02             | -0.41          | -0.15       | 0.23                       | LOW                        |
| Global Non-<br>Government | 0.50         | 0.76              | 0.70           | 0.95        | 0.35                       | GOOD                       |
| US Non-Government         | 0.50         | 0.56              | 0.67           | 0.74        | 0.29                       | GOOD                       |
| Global High Yield         | 2.10         | 1.71              | 1.05           | 0.68        | 0.50                       | GOOD                       |
| Emerging Markets<br>Debt  | -1.00        | -0.84             | -0.21          | 0.15        | 0.55                       | SOME                       |

<sup>1</sup> 'Chain linked' median manager annual return v index in \$US to 31 December 2015. Indices used are provided in the Appendix

<sup>2</sup> Based on Mercer's Global Asset Management Fee Survey 2014 for a \$100m mandate. \$US Segregated vehicles have been used where available

<sup>3</sup> Evidence of skill grading ("alpha ranking") based on annual rolling 10 year relative returns

# EQUITY MARKETS CONCLUSION

| Asset<br>class                | Market<br>opportunity<br>(ex ante) | Actual<br>manager<br>results<br>(ex-post) <sup>1</sup> |   | Active<br>management<br>conviction |   | Rationale  | Preference  |
|-------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|---|------------------------------------|---|--|---|
| US<br>Large Cap               | Low                                | Low  |   | Low                                | > | <ul> <li>High institutional ownership, the availability of information, greater number of analyst coverage and liquidity makes the large cap market efficient</li> <li>No evidence of historic alpha by the median US large cap manager over periods analysed, net of fees</li> </ul>  | For passive management<br>(in particular alternative<br>indexation), unless<br>investor has ability to use<br>high tracking error<br>mandates and has robust<br>governance structure                              |
| Small Cap                     | High                               | High   |   | High                               |   | <ul> <li>Inefficient market due to less available<br/>information, fewer market participants and lower<br/>institutional ownership</li> <li>Long data history available showing strong<br/>evidence of added value by active managers</li> </ul>   | Clear preference for active management  |
| Global<br>Emerging<br>Markets | High                               | Low  | > | Medium                             | > | <ul> <li>Relatively inefficient and highly volatile markets provide opportunity</li> <li>Alpha has generally been added by active managers gross of fees, but results after the high fees in the sector are modest or negative over all periods.</li> <li>However, even passive managers typically modestly underperform in this sector</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>For active management if:</li> <li>Investors have strong conviction in managers' skill</li> <li>Attractive manager fees can be negotiated (compared to the typically high fees in the sector)</li> </ul> |

<sup>1</sup> Based on "alpha ranking" score of fixed income markets on annual rolling 10 year relative returns to 31 December 2015

## FIXED INCOME MARKETS CONCLUSION

| Asset class                         | Market<br>opportunity<br>(ex ante) | Actual<br>manager<br>results<br>(ex-post) <sup>1</sup> | Active<br>management<br>conviction |   | Rationale   | Preference  |
|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|--|------------------------------------|---|---|---|
| Fixed<br>Income<br>(broad<br>based) | Medium                             | Medium   | Medium                             | > | • Evidence of added value by active managers, net of fees, across all markets except Europe   | <ul> <li>For active management if:</li> <li>Investors have strong conviction<br/>in managers' skill</li> <li>Manager fees are reasonable<br/>and targets are aligned</li> </ul> |
| Credit                              | Medium                             | Medium   | Medium                             |   | <ul> <li>Offers active management potential for the skilled investor able to anticipate downgrades, defaults, misclassifications</li> <li>Asymmetry of risk of sector also favours active management</li> <li>Evidence of added value by active managers, gross of fees, though alpha eroded by fees in the UK</li> </ul> | <ul> <li>For active management if:</li> <li>Investors have strong conviction<br/>in managers' skill</li> <li>Manager fees are reasonable<br/>and targets are aligned</li> </ul> |
| Global<br>High Yield                | High                               | Some   | Medium                             |   | <ul> <li>Less efficient market should provide<br/>opportunities for active managers</li> <li>Some evidence that the median manager has<br/>added value after fees. Passive managers<br/>tend to underperform the index by a material<br/>margin in this sector</li> </ul>   | <ul> <li>For active management if:</li> <li>High conviction in managers' skill</li> <li>Attractive fees relative to sector norms</li> </ul>                                     |
| Emerging<br>Market<br>Debt          | High                               | Low  | Medium                             |   | <ul> <li>Offers high raw market potential for<br/>outperformance; fewer market participants<br/>than developed and low overall correlations to<br/>other asset classes</li> <li>Long data history available showing little<br/>evidence of added value by active managers</li> </ul>                                      | <ul><li>For active management if:</li><li>Investors have strong conviction in managers' skill</li></ul>   |

<sup>1</sup> Based on "alpha ranking" score of fixed income markets on annual rolling 10 year relative returns to 31 December 2015

### IMPORTANT NOTICES

© 2017 Mercer LLC. All rights reserved.

This contains confidential and proprietary information of Mercer and is intended for the exclusive use of the parties to whom it was provided by Mercer. Its content may not be modified, sold or otherwise provided, in whole or in part, to any other person or entity, without Mercer's prior written permission.

Mercer does not provide tax or legal advice. You should contact your tax advisor, accountant and/or attorney before making any decisions with tax or legal implications.

The findings, ratings and/or opinions expressed herein are the intellectual property of Mercer and are subject to change without notice. They are not intended to convey any guarantees as to the future performance of the investment products, asset classes or capital markets discussed. Past performance does not guarantee future results. Mercer's ratings do not constitute individualized investment advice.

Information contained herein has been obtained from a range of third party sources. While the information is believed to be reliable, Mercer has not sought to verify it independently. As such, Mercer makes no representations or warranties as to the accuracy of the information presented and takes no responsibility or liability (including for indirect, consequential or incidental damages), for any error, omission or inaccuracy in the data supplied by any third party.

This does not constitute an offer or a solicitation of an offer to buy or sell securities, commodities and/or any other financial instruments or products or constitute a solicitation

For the most recent approved ratings of an investment strategy, and a fuller explanation of their meanings, contact your Mercer representative.

For Mercer's conflict of interest disclosures, contact your Mercer representative or see www.mercer.com/conflictsofinterest.

Returns for periods greater than one year are annualized. Returns are calculated gross of investment management fees, unless noted as net of fees.

Mercer universes: Mercer's universes are intended to provide collective samples of strategies that best allow for robust peer group comparisons over a chosen timeframe. Mercer does not assert that the peer groups are wholly representative of and applicable to all strategies available to investors.

# MAKE MERCER TOMORROW, TODAY