#### **Total Plan Costs Benchmarking Analysis**



North Carolina Supplemental Retirement Plans June 21, 2018

## **Table of Contents**

- Summary Survey Results
  - Peer Group Characteristics
  - Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues
  - Total Administrative Costs
  - Recordkeeping Costs
  - Recordkeeping Services
  - Investment Management / Custody Fees
- Appendix
  - Full Survey Results
  - Additional Information / Notes



## Summary

RVK and Savings Plus would like to **thank you** for participating in the State of California Savings Plus Program's fee benchmarking initiative. The final survey results include information from 21 public plan sponsors that offer primarily 457(b) and 401(k) defined contribution plans with assets ranging from \$1 - \$25 billion and over 25,000 participants. The survey respondents include DC plans for state, county and city employees across the United States.

*North Carolina Supplemental Retirement Plans (NC SRP)* is the sixth largest plan in terms of total assets and the largest plan in terms of total participants. North Carolina's average participant balance of \$36,590 is lower than the median and average balance reported by the peer group.

All reported data is annual as of 12/31/2016, except where noted.



Plan Assets (\$ Billions)







Plan participants is measured by the total number of unique SSNs.

### **Plan Specific Results**

	\$ P	er Particip	ant	%	of Plan Ass	sets
	Average	Median	North Carolina SRP	Average	Median	North Carolina SRP
Total Plan Costs	\$247	\$246	\$169	0.41%	0.38%	0.46%
Investment Management and Custody Costs	\$174	\$161	\$125	0.28%	0.28%	0.34%
Total Admin Costs	\$73	\$67	\$43	0.14%	0.11%	0.12%
Recordkeeping Costs	\$51	\$50	\$34	0.10%	0.07%	0.09%
Professional Services Costs	\$4	\$3	\$3	0.01%	0.01%	0.01%
Internal Costs	<b>\$18</b>	\$17	\$7	0.03%	0.02%	0.02%
Totl Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues	\$73	\$66	\$47	0.13%	0.11%	0.13%
Survey Plan Number:	15					



Total recordkeeping and administration fees are charged to participants through a **\$31 per participant account** recordkeeping and communications fee and **asset based** administration and custody fees of approximately **3.5 bps**.

North Carolina Plan Revenue Sources



- Assel Daseu ree (a)
- Per Participant Fee (\$)



"Other Fees and Revenue" includes securities lending revenue interest, SMIF interest, underfunded fees, STIF rebates, forfeitures, stale dated checks, and service fees collected from participants, as well as a recordkeeper reimbursement for a financial statements audit. Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues are defined as the fees assessed to participants to cover administrative expenses and other non-fee sourced revenues.



Page 7



Plan F	Revenue	<b>Sources</b>
--------	---------	----------------

	Total Plan Administrative Revenues (% Plan Assets)	Total Plan Administrative Revenues (\$ Per Participant)
Average	0.13%	\$ 73
Min	0.04%	\$ 43
25th Percentile	0.08%	\$ 52
Median	0.11%	\$ 66
75th Percentile	0.15%	\$ 84
Max	0.38%	\$ 187
NC SRP	0.13%	\$ 47

Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues are defined as the fees assessed to participants to cover administrative expenses and other non-fee sourced revenues.



Page 8

## **Total Administrative Costs**

#### **Plan Administrative Costs (\$ Per Participant)**



Total Administrative Costs are defined as the sum of recordkeeping, professional services (audit, consulting, legal, technology, and other) and internal costs.

## **Total Administrative Costs**

Compared to the median peer, North Carolina SRP has lower recordkeeping, professional services, and internal costs.





- RK Costs (\$ / Participant)
- Professional Services Costs (\$ / Participant)
- Internal Costs (\$ / Participant)

#### Median Admin Cost Breakdown



- Recordkeeping Costs (\$ / Participant)
- Professional Services Costs (\$ / Participant)
- Internal Costs (\$ / Participant)

Note: allocations above may not sum to the total figures due to rounding.

Total Administrative Costs are defined as the sum of recordkeeping, professional services (audit, consulting, legal, technology, and other) and internal costs.



#### Recordkeeper Contract Fee Structures



- Asset Based Fee Only
- Per Participant Fee Only
- Asset Based and Per Participant Fee
- Other Fee Structure
- Contract Structure Not Provided

	Recordkeeping Costs (% Plan Assets)	Costs	keeping (\$ Per tipant)
Average	0.10%	\$	51
Min	0.03%	\$	23
25th Percentile	0.05%	\$	35
Median	0.07%	\$	50
75th Percentile	0 11%	\$	58
Max	0.28%	\$	138
NC SRP	0.09%	\$	34



### **Recordkeeping – Services**





#### Dedicated Education Representatives Per 20,000 Participants



Plans with no reported education or call center representatives either indicated that they had none or did not provide a response.



### **Investment Management and Custody Fees**

Investment Management and Custody Fees Paid (% of Total Assets)



RVK

## **Investment Management Fees**

#### Minimum Investment Fee (%) for Any Single Investment in the Plan's Portfolio



#### Maximum Investment Fee (%) for Any Single Investment in the Plan's Portfolio



Plan 13 did not provide minimum and maximum investment fees.

## **Survey Results**



Plans Included in the Survey Results:			
CalPERS Supplemental Income Plans	New York State Deferred Compensation Plan		
City and County of San Francisco Deferred Compensation	North Carolina Supplemental Retirement Plans		
City of Los Angeles Deferred Compensation Plan	Ohio Deferred Compensation Program		
Colorado PERA	State of Arizona Deferred Compensation Plan		
Commonwealth of Pennsylvania State Employees' Retirement System 457 Deferred Compensation Plan	State of California Savings Plus Program		
County of San Diego Deferred Compensation	State of Hawaii Deferred Compensation Plan		
Indiana Public Employees' Deferred Compensation Plan	State of Mississippi Deferred Compensation Plan		
Kentucky Public Employees' Deferred Compensation Plan	State of Missouri Deferred Compensation Plan		
Los Angeles County Deferred Compensation Plan	State Of South Carolina Deferred Compensation Program		
Maryland Supplemental Retirement Plans	Wisconsin Deferred Compensation Program		
New York City Deferred Compensation Plan			



### **Plan Specific Results**

	\$ P	er Particip	ant	%	of Plan Ass	sets
	Average	Median	North Carolina SRP	Average	Median	North Carolina SRP
Total Plan Costs	\$247	\$246	\$169	0.41%	0.38%	0.46%
Investment Management and Custody Costs	\$174	\$161	\$125	0.28%	0.28%	0.34%
Total Admin Costs	\$73	\$67	\$43	0.14%	0.11%	0.12%
Recordkeeping Costs	\$51	\$50	\$34	0.10%	0.07%	0.09%
Professional Services Costs	\$4	\$3	\$3	0.01%	0.01%	0.01%
Internal Costs	<b>\$18</b>	\$17	\$7	0.03%	0.02%	0.02%
Totl Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues	\$73	\$66	\$47	0.13%	0.11%	0.13%
Survey Plan Number:	15					



Plan Assets (\$ Billions)



Median: \$3.5 B Average: \$6.0 B

KVK

#### **Number of Plan Participants**





Plan participants is measured by the total number of unique SSNs



#### **Average Participant Balance**



Median: \$58,500 Average: \$66,800



Plan Type Composition (\$ Billions)





## **Survey Results**

### **Total Plan Costs**

#### **Overall Cost Breakdown**





### **Total Plan Costs**

#### **Total Plan Costs (\$ Per Participant)**





### **Total Plan Costs**

#### **Total Plan Costs (% of Plan Assets)**



Total Plan Costs are defined as the sum of investment management and custody, recordkeeping, professional services, and internal costs.

Plan Revenues by Category



"Other Fees and Revenue" includes securities lending revenue interest, SMIF interest, underfunded fees, STIF rebates, forfeitures, stale dated checks, and service fees collected from participants, as well as a recordkeeper reimbursement for a financial statements audit. Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues are defined as the fees assessed to participants to cover administrative expenses and other non-fee sourced revenues.



Page 26



#### **Plan Revenue Sources**

	Total Plan Administrative Revenues (% Plan Assets)	Total Plan Administrative Revenues (\$ Per Participant)
Average	0.13%	\$ 73
Min	0.04%	\$ 43
25th Percentile	0.08%	\$ 52
Median	0.11%	\$ 66
75th Percentile	0.15%	\$ 84
Max	0.38%	\$ 187

Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues are defined as the fees assessed to participants to cover administrative expenses and other non-fee sourced revenues.





#### **Revenue Sharing**

Plans that only utilize revenue sharing to fund plan expenses Plans that do not reimburse any revenue sharing to participants Plans that retain some or all revenue sharing for plan expenses Plans that reimburse some or all revenue sharing Plans that Collect Revenue Sharing Plans with no revenue sharing

**Revenue Sharing Use** 



Recordkeeping and Administration Fees / Revenues are defined as the fees assessed to participants to cover administrative expenses and other non-fee sourced revenues. Page 28

Unique Plan Participant Fee Structures				
Annual asset based fee, which is	Graduated fee: no fee if balance under			
waived for participants with balances	\$5,000, \$12 annual if between \$5,001-			
less than \$5,000. Fees are capped at	25,000,and \$180 annually for			
\$55 per quarter.	account balances over \$250,000.			
Asset based fee and a per participant fee, assessed per account (not unique SSN) for an account value above \$500.	Asset based fee capped at \$125 annually.			
Asset based fee assessed through	Per participant fee waived for first 6			
investment fund expense ratios, with an	months immediately following			
additional per participant fee.	enrollment			



### **Total Administrative Costs**

#### **Administrative Cost Breakdown**



Total Administrative Costs are defined as the sum of recordkeeping, professional services, and internal costs.



## **Total Administrative Costs**

#### **Plan Administrative Costs (\$ Per Participant)**





Total Administrative Costs are defined as the sum of recordkeeping, professional services, and internal costs.

#### **Recordkeeping Costs vs. Year of Last Fee Negotiation**



# Recordkeeping Costs (\$ / Participant) vs. Number of Plan Participants



#### **Recordkeeper Contract Fee Structures**



- Asset Based Fee Only
- Per Participant Fee Only
- Asset Based and Per Participant Fee
- Other Fee Structure
- Contract Structure Not Provided

#### Unique Components of Recordkeeper Contract Fee Structures

Set basis point fee based on different levels of plan assets (e.g. \$1.260 billion to equal or less than \$1.402 billion; 22.25 basis points)	Per participant fee, waived during the first year of enrollment
Asset based fee, with breakpoints that reduce the revenue requirement 0.5 bps for every \$300,000,000 in asset growth	Asset based fee with reimbursement credit for internal administrative costs
Per participant fee and asset based fee. (Unique in recordkeeping contract, though common in participant fee collection.)	Per participant fee with overall hard dollar cap that varies annually based on pre- determined fee changes
Asset based fee, capped at \$2,000 per account per year.	Per participant fee, reduced based on the percentage of plan assets in managed accounts. (e.g., if 10% of total assets, the annual fee will drop by \$4 per unique SSN



	Recordkeeping Costs (% Plan Assets)	Recordkeeping Costs (\$ Per Participant)
Average	0.10%	\$51
Min	0.03%	\$ 23
25th Percentile	0.05%	\$ 35
Median	0.07%	\$ 50
75th Percentile	0.11%	\$ 58
Мах	0.28%	\$ 138

# Recordkeeping Costs (\$ / Participant) vs. % Assets Managed by the Recordkeeper





Plan 13 did not indicate the percentage of assets managed by the recordkeeper.

### **Recordkeeping – Services**



#### **Dedicated Education Representatives Per** <u>20,000</u> **Participants**

#### **Dedicated Call Center Representatives Per 20,000 Participants**



### **Recordkeeping – Services**

#### Does the recordkeeper cover costs for:

Travel for internal staff to attend due diligence meetings with the recordkeeper service provider (e.g. cost of travel, lodging, per diem, etc.)?

Recordkeeper	Yes	No
Empower	1	6
ICMA-RC	0	1
Nationwide	4	2
Prudential	1	2
Voya	0	1
Total	6	12

Continuing education services for internal staff (e.g. conferences and seminars, registration, travel, lodging, per diem, materials, etc.)?

Recordkeeper	Yes	No
Empower	1	6
ICMA-RC	0	1
Nationwide	3	3
Prudential	1	2
Voya	0	1
Total	5	13

Custom recordkeeping system updates and programming changes?

Recordkeeper	Yes	No
Empower	2	5
ICMA-RC	1	0
Nationwide	6	0
Prudential	3	0
Voya	1	0
Total	13	5



The Plan with Internal/Self Recordkeeping was excluded from the charts above. Plans 4 and 8 did not provide a response.
### **Recordkeeping – Services**

#### **Educational Services Provided**



- Plans with Fees for Additional Contractual Occurances
- Plans with Contractual Amounts
- Plans Where Recordkeeper Provides Service



Other includes a participant facing website and quarterly meeting attendance. No plans reported fees for additional contractual occurrences.

Professional Services Costs (\$) vs. Plan Size



#### Professional Services Costs (% of Total Admin Costs) vs. Plan Size





**Professional Services Costs** 

Consulting includes investment consulting and other consulting. Other Professional Services includes miscellaneous, education, and contractual payroll expenses.



Internal Cost (\$) vs. Plan Size



Internal Cost (% of Total Admin Cost) vs. Plan Size





#### **Dedicated Internal Staffing Reported:**

#### **Internal Costs Reported:**



	Professional Service Costs (\$ Per Participant)		Internal Costs (\$ Per Participant)
Average	\$	4	\$ 18
Min	\$	-	\$ -
25th Percentile	\$	1	\$ 4
Median	\$	3	\$ 17
75th Percentile	\$	7	\$ 25
Max	\$	12	\$ 65



### **Investment Management and Custody Fees**

Investment Management and Custody Fees Paid (% of Total Assets)





### **Investment Management and Custody Fees**

#### Minimum Investment Fee (%) for Any Single Investment in the Plan's Portfolio



Maximum Investment Fee (%) for Any Single Investment in the Plan's Portfolio



Plan 13 did not provide minimum and maximum investment fees.

### **Reserves Account**



#### Plan Reserve Balance (% of Annual Admin Revenue)

#### Plan Reserve Balance (% of Annual Admin Costs)



### **Managed Accounts**

9 Plans indicated that they currently utilize managed accounts.





Note: Plans 4, 9, and 19 indicated that they had managed accounts but did not provided participant utilization data.

## **Self-Directed Brokerage Account**

**Brokerage Providers** 



#### Percentage of Plan Participants with Assets in the SDBA



Plans 8 and 13 indicated that they had brokerage accounts but did not provide the participant utilization.

Page 46

### **Self-Directed Brokerage Account**

# Percentage of Plan Assets in the SDBA 8.0% 7.0% 6.0% 5.0% 4.0% 3.0% 2.0% 1.0%

Plan 8 did not indicate if the Plan assesses recordkeeping fees on the brokerage account assets.

5

1

3

21

0.0%

12

2

20

13

4

11

9

19

7

16

8

### **Transactional Fees**



#### Number of Plans Reporting:

#### **Fee Information**

QDRO fees range from \$250-\$300

No plans have distribution fees

Overnight Check fees are most commonly \$25 (9 plans)



### **Transactional Fees**



Number of Plans Reporting Loan Initiation Fees of:





#### Page 49

### **Appendix: Notes on Survey Data**

- All data is as reported by plan sponsors.
- For Plan 8, number of accounts was used as a proxy for total unique SSNs.
- All reported data is annual as of 12/31/2016, except for Plan 4, which provided data as of 6/30/16.
- Plan 8 did not provide plan reserves. Plans 1 and 14 indicated that there are no professional services or internal costs and no plan reserves.
- Plans 3, 5, 8, and 18 did not provide details on internal staffing resources.



#### PORTLAND

#### CHICAGO

**NEW YORK** 

**Disclaimer of Warranties and Limitation of Liability** - This document was prepared by RVK and may include information and data from other third-party sources as we believe necessary or appropriate. RVK has taken reasonable care to ensure the accuracy of the information or data, but makes no warranties and disclaims responsibility for the accuracy or completeness of information or data provided or methodologies employed by any external source. This document is provided for general information only and does not constitute a recommendation by RVK or an offer of, or a solicitation for, any particular security or product and it is not intended to convey any guarantees as to the future performance of any investment products, asset classes, or capital markets.

